



**Town of Woodbury
Historic District Commission**

281 Main Street South
Woodbury, CT 06798
203.263.3467 • www.woodburyct.org

MINUTES – January 8, 2024

REGULAR MEETING

7:30 PM –Shove Building, 281 Main Street South, Woodbury, CT 06798

MEMBERS PRESENT

Maureen Donnarumma, Chair
George Messier
Lois Y. Fiftal

MEMBERS ABSENT

ALTERNATES PRESENT

Marc Kroll
Judith Kelz

ALTERNATES ABSENT

William Hickey

NOTED OTHERS PRESENT

Thomas Arras, James Daly, Stanley Dzenutis, Lisa Amatruda, Tom Amatruda, Lyman Gilbert, Ariana Beers, John Lamb, Sal Cappuzzo, Julio Duke

OPENING OF MEETING

- **Call to Order**
Chair Donnarumma convened the regular meeting at 7:30 pm.
- **Seating of Members / Alternates**
Seated for the meeting were Chair Donnarumma, Members Fiftal, Messier, Alt Members Kroll and Kelz
- **Conflict of Interest Reminder (CGS §8-11 & Woodbury Town Charter Section 901)**
Chair Donnarumma reminded the Commission of Conflict of Interest; No member expressed a conflict with any matter on the agenda.

Election of Officers

MOTION: To nominate and elect Maureen Donnarumma as Chair

Made by **FIFTAL**, Seconded by **MESSIER**

Vote: 5-0-0 **Approved** – Motion Passed

Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier

Nay None

Abstain None

MOTION: To nominate and elect Lois Fiftal as Vice Chair
Made by **DONNARUMMA**, Seconded by **KELZ**
Vote: 5-0-0 **Approved** – Motion **Passed**
Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier
Nay None
Abstain None

MOTION: To nominate and elect Bill Hickey as Secretary
Made by **KROLL**, Seconded by **MESSIER**
Vote: 5-0-0 **Approved** – Motion **Passed**
Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier
Nay None
Abstain None

PUBLIC HEARINGS

- **23-HD-0026 – 270 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 12 / MSD & HD#1**
James C. Daly, Jr., Trustee (James C. Daly 2023 Revocable Trust) and Isabel T. R., Daly, Trustee (Isabel T. R. Daly 2023 Revocable Trust (applicant/owner)
Section 8: Windows – Replacement of 23 existing 12 over 12 wood windows and wood trim with new aluminum exterior clad 12 over 12 windows and wood trim.

Clerk Bigham read the Public Notice. Owner James Daly (270 Main Street South, Woodbury) and contractor, Stanley Dzenutis (Norfolk, CT) came forward. Mr. Daly is looking to replace the windows with a window that is full wood on the inside, but aluminum clad on the outside and the mullions will look like putty.

Chair Donnerumma stated based on a walk of the property the windows look like they are in perfect condition. Mr. Dzenutis explained that from the inside they are not operable and the paint around them is lead paint that needs to be remediated. Mr. Daly stated that the purpose of replacing the windows is for function, insulation and to make them operable. He is trying to keep the historic look of the building and is looking to go back to the original 12 over 12 on all the windows. He also stated that some of the windows he is requesting to change are replacement windows, so those are not original to the house.

Chair Donnerumma asked how long these replacement windows will last? Mr. Dzenutis said they will last a lifetime as long as they are maintained. Chair Donnerumma followed that up with the windows that are there have lasted this long. Mr. Dzenutis stated that is a little deceiving because the sills have a lot of dry rot, the pins don't work, no weights in the windows, so when you lift them up, they can come right back down. These replacement windows will not affect the harmony of the house.

Mr. Daly stated the replacement windows will also be energy efficient and with the price of oil they will help with some of the heat cost. Chair Donnerumma expressed that they can get the same energy efficiency with the storm windows and Mr. Dzenutis disagreed with that because the windows are not tight and the heat loss from a house is about 25% from the windows. Mr. Daly stated that if they were to put on storm windows because most of the windows do not have them it would also take away the historic nature of the property.

Mr. Dzenutis read the Historic Districts and Historic Properties section in the CT General Statutes Sec. 7-147a. He feels that these windows will improve the harmony of the District and that is what this section of the statute says.

Mr. Dzenutis also stated that with the aluminum clad windows you would not be able to tell from the road that they are aluminum because they will be painted both inside and outside, just like a wood window would be.

Member Messier asked what the average cost of each window will be? Mr. Daly stated that before installation it will be about \$1,700 a window, installed \$2,100 per window. So, he is not saving money installing these windows, but in a way, he will be, because the energy efficiency of them will catch up over time replied Ms. Dzenutis.

He is looking to replace these windows for three main reasons: 1) Operability; 2) Energy efficiency; and 3) Safety regarding the lead.

Public Comments

- Lisa Amatruda (19 Orchard Ave) spoke in favor of the window replacement. She said that the house is a beautiful house and didn't realize the disrepair of the existing windows. She supports the change for the upgrade with the aluminum clad.
- Sal Cappuzzo (230 Main Street South) spoke in favor of the aluminum clad.

Motion: To close public hearing (23-HD-0026 – 270 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 12/MSD & HD#1)

Made by **KELZ**, Seconded by **FIFTAL**

Vote: 5-0-0 – **Approved** – Motion Passed

Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier
Nay None
Abstain None

- **23-HD-0029 – 256 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 14 / MSD & HD#1**

Tim Drakeley (applicant), 256 Main Street South LLC (owner)

Section 8: Windows – Install 3 wooden windows (24"x28", 6 light, single sash, wood trim) on clapboard wall of accessory outbuilding.

Clerk Bigham read the Public Notice. No one present to speak on behalf of the application.

MOTION: To close public hearing (23-HD-0029 – 256 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 14 / MSD & HD#1)

Made by **FIFTAL**, Seconded by **KELZ**

Vote: 5-0-0 **Approved** – Motion Passed

Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier
Nay None
Abstain None

- **23-HD-0031 – 107 Main Street North / Map 90, Lot 5 / MSD & HD#1**
Tradewinds LLC (applicant), 107 Main Street North Woodbury, LLC (owner)
Section 12: Other – Install AC condenser unit (work completed without a permit).

Clerk Bigham read the Public Notice. No one present to speak on behalf of the application.

MOTION: To close public hearing (23-HD-0031 – 107 Main Street North / Map 90, Lot 5 / MSD & HD#1)

Made by **KELZ**, Seconded by **FIFTAL**

Vote: 5-0-0 **Approved** – Motion **Passed**

Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier

Nay None

Abstain None

NEW APPLICATIONS

- **23-HD-0033 – 4 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 44 / MSD District & HD#1**
Thomas and Lisa Amatruda (applicant/owner)
Section 8: Windows – Replace 16 upper floor “wood” windows (6x6 true divided light single pane glass) with 16 new “aluminum clad” wood windows (6x6 simulated divided light double pane insulated glass); and Replace 2 front upper floor “wood” windows (15x15 true divided light single pane glass with 2 new “aluminum clad” wood windows (double hung 15x15 simulated divided light double pane insulated glass).

Thomas and Lisa Amatruda (19 Orchard Ave) came forward to speak on behalf of the application.

Lisa Amatruda stated that these windows are just for the top floor. The sill and interior needs to be rebuilt. She feels that the historic value is not what it should be since the building has aluminum siding on it already. She continued to say that they have a building permit application in for review to renovate the upstairs apartments, but it is being stopped until the decision about the windows is made.

Tom Amatruda reiterated what Lisa said with the building already having aluminum siding and that the building is not in the original condition, so they are asking for the aluminum clad wood windows because the building is aluminum.

Tom reminded the commission that they did a site walk and saw the condition of the existing windows. They are in such disrepair and not restorable because it’s been decades since they were maintained. They aren’t even worth restoring because they are not original windows. They were maybe 1920’s not 1800’s.

MOTION: To accept application (23-HD-0033 – 4 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 44 / MSD District & HD#1) and schedule for public hearing on February 5, 2024.

Made by **KROLL**, Seconded by **KELZ**

Vote: 5-0-0 – **Approved** – Motion **Passed**

Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier

Nay None

Abstain None

- **23-HD-0037 – 118 Main Street South / Map 105, Lot 123 / MSD District and HD#1**
Lissa Lovetere and Michael A. Gugliotti, Jr. Trustees (applicant/owner)
Section 10: Roof – Frame new “asphalt shingled pitched roof” over existing “rubber flat roof.”

Lyman Gilbert from LG Building and Remodeling (1350 Southford Road, Southbury) came forward to speak on behalf of the application.

They are looking to put a pitched roof on the back flat portion of the building to help with the roof leaking. The slight pitch of 5’ will be just enough so the water will run off. You will not be able to see it from Main Street South, but it can be seen coming down School Street.

Alt. Member Kelz asked if this is the original section to the house? Mr. Gilbert said no that it wasn’t but did not have a date as to when it was added.

Chair Donnarumma questioned if the material will match the existing asphalt roof shingles and Mr. Gilbert confirmed that it will.

MOTION: To accept application (23-HD-0037 – 118 Main Street South / Map 105, Lot 123 / MSD District and HD#1) and schedule for public hearing on February 5, 2024.

Made by FIFTAL, Seconded by KELZ

Vote: 5-0-0 – **Approved** – Motion Passed

Aye	Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier
Nay	None
Abstain	None

- **23-HD-0038 – 8 Spring Street / Map 105, Lot 123 / MSD District and HD#1**
Peter Frederic Kelemencky (applicant/owner), Bright Planet Solar (agent)
Section 12: Other – Roof mounted solar array of 35 panels covering every pitched roof surface of existing house and accessory detached garage, including utility line trench from garage to main panel in house. Cluster added utility wall mounted connections on left front side of house.

Ariana Beers, Bright Planet Solar representative, came forward to speak on behalf of the application.

Chair Donnarumma questioned if they will cover the whole roof and if not, will they have to match the existing roof? Ms. Beers answered by explaining that for the homeowner to reach the maximum production of electricity that is required for their consumption they would need all the panels on the entire house and garage to be efficient so the roof will be covered, and they will not have to match anything.

MOTION: To accept application (23-HD-0038 – 8 Spring Street / Map 105, Lot 123 / MSD District and HD#1) and schedule for public hearing on February 5, 2024.

Made by FIFTAL, Seconded by KELZ

Vote: 5-0-0 – **Approved** – Motion Passed

Aye	Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier
Nay	None
Abstain	None

- **24-HD-0001 – 346 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 2A-2 / MSD District and HD#1**

The Birches on Main, LLC (applicant/owner), John Lamb (sole member)

Section 5: Fences – Post and picket fencing.

Owner John Lamb (17 Strathmore Road, Middlebury) came forward to speak on behalf of the application.

Mr. Lamb stated that he has a buyer for the property, and they would like to put a fence up for their dog. The fence is similar to what was there in the past, which was a post and picket fence.

Mr. Lamb explained the location of the fence to start at the back garage to the deck off the back unit. It will go to the covered portico. Much of the fencing will be behind existing plantings.

MOTION: To accept application (24-HD-0001 – 346 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 2A-2 / MSD District and HD#1) and schedule for public hearing on February 5, 2024.

Made by **KELZ**, Seconded by **FIFTAL**

Vote: 5-0-0 – **Approved** – Motion Passed

Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier

Nay None

Abstain None

- **24-HD-0003 – 230 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 18 / MSD District and HD#1**

Splitrail, LLC (applicant/owner) - After the fact application:

Section 5: Windows – Replace 14 upper story “aluminum clad exterior” windows with new “aluminum clad” windows, wood grills and wood interior.

Section 12: Other – Remove attic vent on front of building; and remove old unused kitchen vent stack on south façade.

Owner Sal Cappuzzo and contractor Julio Duke (230 Main Street South) came forward to speak on behalf of the application.

This application is an after the fact application. These windows are for the upper story only. The windows being replaced were aluminum windows, so they installed the aluminum clad. They also removed the front attic vent and covered it with siding.

Along with this application they removed the kitchen vent on the side of the building near the parking lot and put siding over the opening.

A concern regarding a permit for the side stairs was brought up. Applicant said the building inspector looked at it, but it was determined that the application does not need to be amended because the staircase was existing.

MOTION: To accept application (24-HD-0003 – 230 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 18 / MSD District and HD#1) and schedule for public hearing on February 5, 2024.

Made by **KROLL**, Seconded by **FIFTAL**

Vote: 5-0-0 – **Approved** – Motion Passed

Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier

Nay None

Abstain None

DELIBERATIONS

- **23-HD-0026 – 270 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 12 / MSD & HD#1**
James C. Daly, Jr., Trustee (James C. Daly 2023 Revocable Trust) and Isabel T. R., Daly, Trustee (Isabel T. R. Daly 2023 Revocable Trust (applicant/owner)
Section 8: Windows – Replacement of 23 existing 12 over 12 wood windows and wood trim with new aluminum exterior clad 12 over 12 windows and wood trim.

Alt. Member Kroll is conflicted again. The feedback given tonight and hearing about preservation he is still thinking about it.

Member Messier states that making an investment doesn't mean ripping out the old and putting in new. That doesn't make it a value, it just makes it new. He hears the arguments about fixing and maintenance but that is what comes with buying a historic house. He is concerned about always hearing the windows are not repairable. He has raised his family in multiple houses that have had lead paint. You just must maintain the paint, so the kids don't get to it. He also thinks the windows are in great shape but remains conflicted.

Alt. Member Kelz considers herself the most sympathetic person regarding the windows. She accepts what it entails to live in an older house. She understands safety issues, environmental concerns, and economic portion, but their obligation is to preserve and to advise as to what they can do. After hearing the speaker tonight talk, she understands that there are very few windows that cannot be repaired. She walked the property also and she suggests having some craftsmen come in and have them restored.

Member Fiftal agreed with what Kelz said and she agrees the Commission needs to look at historic preservation.

Chair Donnarumma stated that some of the windows were already replacement windows, and they were replaced with wood windows with the only difference being that instead of the 12/12 they were 12/2. She went on to say that those replacement windows that were installed probably predated the Historic District, but they are historic windows as is. They are probably 150 years old or around that.

MOTION: To deny application 23-HD-0026 – 270 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 12 / MSD & HD#1 seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of replacement windows of 23 existing 12 over 12 wood windows and wood trim with new aluminum exterior clad 12 over 12 windows and wood trim per §8.1.2 because deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced.

Made by **DONNARUMMA**, Seconded by **KELZ**

Vote: 4-1-0 – **Approved** – Motion Passed

Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kelz, Messier

Nay Kroll

Abstain None

- **23-HD-0029 – 256 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 14 / MSD & HD#1**
 Tim Drakeley (applicant), 256 Main Street South LLC (owner)
Section 8: Windows – Install 3 wooden windows (24"x28", 6 light, single sash, wood trim) on clapboard wall of accessory outbuilding.

The members discussed the placement and the materials for clarification.

MOTION: To approve application 23-HD-0029 – 256 Main Street South / Map 104, Lot 14 / MSD & HD#1 a Certificate of Appropriateness as requested for the installation of 3 new wooden windows (24"x28", 6 light, single-sash, wood trim) on existing clapboard sided side wall of existing accessory outbuilding.

Made by **MESSIER**, Seconded by **KROLL**

Vote: 5-0-0 – **Approved** – Motion Passed

Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier

Nay None

Abstain None

- **23-HD-0031 – 107 Main Street North / Map 90, Lot 5 / MSD & HD#1**
 Tradewinds LLC (applicant), 107 Main Street North Woodbury, LLC (owner)
Section 12: Other – Install AC condenser unit (work completed without a permit).

MOTION: To approve application 23-HD-0031 – 107 Main Street North / Map 90, Lot 5 / MSD & HD#1 a Certificate of Appropriateness (retroactively) as requested for installation of an AC condenser unit.

Made by **MESSIER**, Seconded by **FIFTAL**

Vote: 5-0-0 – **Approved** – Motion Passed

Aye Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier

Nay None

Abstain None

- **Meeting Minutes** – December 4, 2023

MOTION: To accept meeting minutes of December 4, 2023, as presented.

Made by **FIFTAL**, Seconded by **KROLL**

Vote: 5-0-0 – **Approved** – Motion Passed

Ayes Donnarumma, Fiftal, Kroll, Kelz, Messier

Nays None

Abstain None

OTHER BUSINESS

- None

Enforcement Matters

- None

COMMISSION HOUSEKEEPING

- Member Messier questioned if he could get the work session information. He was told that he can go to David Peckar's (CrateCrafts) shop and to contact him directly to set that up.
- Member Messier questioned what can they do about people doing the work and then asking for forgiveness? Chair Donnarumma said that just because the work has been completed doesn't mean that it is automatically approved, and they still need to approve and review the application. He's just concerned that more people will do that. Alt. Kelz questioned what their recourse is. Can the property owner be fined?

CORRESPONDENCE

- Chair Donnarumma shared an email from Stacey Vairo, Preservation Connecticut, regarding some links on their website regarding window preservation.
 - Here is the link to the entire website – [Local Historic District and Property Commissions in Connecticut \(lhdct.org\)](http://LocalHistoricDistrictandPropertyCommissionsinConnecticut.lhdct.org)
 - The Frequently Asked Questions section is here - [Local Historic District and Property Commissions in Connecticut \(lhdct.org\)](http://LocalHistoricDistrictandPropertyCommissionsinConnecticut.lhdct.org)

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

- Thomas Arras – 76 Main Street South – Earlier in the meeting, before the Public Hearings, Mr. Arras questioned the attendance of some members. He questioned if anything was going to be done about their absents. His records show they missed more than 2/3's of the meetings.
- Mr. Arras also stated, from the Connecticut state statues CHAPTER 97a* HISTORIC DISTRICTS AND HISTORIC PROPERTIES Sec. 7-147y. Exempted acts. Delay of demolition. (a) Nothing in this part shall be construed to prevent the ordinary maintenance or repair of any exterior architectural feature within the boundaries of an historic property which does not involve a change in the appearance or design thereof; nor to prevent the erection or alteration of any such feature which the building inspector or a similar agent certifies is required by the public safety because of a condition which is unsafe or dangerous due to deterioration; nor to prevent the erection or alteration of any such feature under a permit issued by a building inspector or similar agent prior to designation of such historic property.

He feels that this section can be applied to a lot of things in the District. He referred to the Commission for when they were looking into other town regulations especially Newtown. He said that Newtown does this and this section of the CT State Statute should go along with the Historic District Regulations. They discussed that the Historic District can be stricter than the CT State Statue, but they just can't be looser.

More discussion about this section and Member Messier said that if you go to the appearance and design language it goes back to like for like which means design and not material, which was told to him by the New England Preservation. Although New England Preservation was clear on the design is like for like they are very, very strong on preserving with what you have. You don't go around replacing everything.

- Alt. Member Kelz really thinks since they have compiled a lot of information for the past couple of months the next workshop should be working on tightening up the regulations. She feels like the public needs recommendation and maybe it would avoid people submitting applications that they will never approve. Chair Donnarumma stated that they cannot have one homeowner or one contractor that comes in and doesn't get what they want to have to change our whole Historic District.
- Mr. Arras reminded them that they have many different materials in the Historic District that once was approved, somethings do move forward with the progression on time, but to say the old windows are as efficient as the new windows is wrong.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no objections, the meeting was adjourned at 9:13 pm.

RECEIVED & FILED
IN WOODBURY, CT
This 16th day of Jan 2024
at 9:40 o'clock A.M.
Maria M. Mancini